

Evaluation sheet for 2004 Grant Proposal I-9

Grant Proposal Category 1_ - 9 _____

Grant Proposal Category II

Title of Activity _____ Online dictionary of national history of science bibliographies & archival sources

Formal requirements*: Met X Not met _____

* * * * *

Appraisal**

(A)
Excellent

(B)
Good

(C)
Weak

(F)
Flawed

1. Relevance to ICSU Priorities in the call for application (Themes, Geographical coverage, Interdisciplinary, Participation of developing country scientists and women scientists; Number of supporting applicants and their roles; Potential to act as a catalyst for future ICSU activities)

Relationship to priority on Dissemination of scientific knowledge is well established. Geographical coverage is wide. The project is foundational in nature; that is, it will serve as a primary building-block for future work on the history of science.

Grade: A

2. Scientific Quality (Innovativeness; Definition of goals; Description of methodology; Significance of possible output; Added value to science)

There is a conceptual framework and methodological plan to achieve the objectives. The submission is forthright in identifying the challenges to accomplishing the project's goals.

The report of the Expert Committee meeting noted that key technical issues have been deferred to allow more time for technical consultation. This underscores the degree of difficulty that will be encountered.

Grade: B

3. Cost/time effectiveness (Realism of budget; Significance of ICSU financial support on the proposed activity; Expectation to complete activity within stipulated time frame)

The three phase work plan is clearly presented.

The project is very ambitious and its success depends on many partners; therein lies perhaps its major weakness but also its strength. Given the technical and language issues, a more modest outcome is likely.

Grade: B

4. Strength of the proposers (Reputation; Numbers; Collaborators)

The proposal has a strong group of primary participants as well as institutional support in Mexico and the United Kingdom. This is one of the project's main assets. The Experts Committee has already begun work and its report suggests a high level of commitment to see the project to completion.

Grade: A

Summary: DHS, the Division of History of Sciences from IUHPS with the support from: IAU, IUGS, the Russian Academy of Sciences and the Mexican Academy, is determined to accomplish a series of actions whose aim is to preserve and disseminate the world scientific documentation through electronic means. In addition to its basic merit and feasibility (assuming the technical hurdles are overcome), the project is very much international in nature. It also represents a major effort from a Union with a unique role in the ICSU family to address the changes implemented by ICSU to make grants more outcome oriented. While the scope of the project is probably overly ambitious for a single proposal, the nature of the project and its capacity to sustain IUHPS internal reforms also support a higher grade.

Summary grade : A-